

Gender Equality in the Agricultural Sector: Lessons Learned from the Baduy Indigenous Community in Indonesia

Mirajiani[†]

Abstract

The Baduy people are one of the indigenous communities living in Indonesia at present. The community upholds traditional ways of life based on a customary construction whose application is preserved to date. The study aims to analyse the gender system in the Baduy indigenous community through a qualitative approach, especially in the agricultural field. The research results indicate a division of responsibilities in relation to scope, roles, work, access, control of kinship relationships, marriage patterns, and inheritance patterns between women and men in the community from both productive and domestic perspectives. These differences, however, were not observed to lead to inequality since the system's value derives from the Baduy community's cultural construction that guarantees, maintains, and protects gender equality. Moreover, the present study shows us that traditionality is not a factor of gender inequality; traditional cultural constructions have their own mechanisms to create gender equality.

Keywords: Gender; Equality; Agriculture; The Baduy; Indigenous Community; Indonesia

[†] Associate Professor, Department of Agribusiness, Faculty of Agriculture, Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University, Jl. Raya Palka KM.03 Sindangsari, Kecamatan Pabuaran, Kabupaten Serang, Provinsi Banten 42163, Indonesia, Email: mirajiani@yahoo.com

© 2023 Mirajiani. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.0>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Introduction

Traditional indigenous communities still exist in the current climate and maintain their social and life practices based on cultural systems, customs, and unique traditions recognised by international and state laws. The existence of indigenous communities has been recognised by international law manifested in the Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989, also known as ILO Convention 169 or C169, concerning the presence of these communities in independent states that require their individual governments and states to respect their indigenous culture and spiritual values. Therefore, the indigenous community is an entity that must be recognised and protected through an acknowledgement of their rights to self-determination, personal development, owning property, living well, good health, and other rights that are presented by the convention without requiring any form of modernisation. This is a crucial aspect that must be considered in the context that modernisation-based development approaches targeting indigenous people tend to be conducted on a large scale, are uniform in nature, and do not consider the uniqueness of these communities' social characteristics (Dore, 2021). This form of development does not generally result in any benefits or positive impacts for the indigenous people. On the contrary, they receive no benefits, and even their way of life is marginalised (Noorikhsan and Gunawan, 2022).

With the increasing intensity of the introduction of gender issues in rural development programmes, the demand for an increased understanding of the gender issues present in indigenous communities is a crucial aspect required in the research to accurately conduct their development planning and process (Puspitawati, 2013; Qomariah, 2019; Dudgeon and Bray, 2019). Women's involvement in the development of a community is an ethical requirement for creating a gender-aware development process in traditional social systems based on value systems and ideologies specific to the customs and traditions

maintained from time to time in a specific indigenous community.

Gender and Development

Gender and development are both tenets observable from various perspectives, namely, social, political, economic, and cultural (Lips, 2020). The term gender refers to the explanation of the differences existing between women and men, who have different, innate characteristics, and the cultural developments and social constructions attached to them. Gender issues occur when a society confounds these seemingly unchangeable, natural, human characteristics with changeable, non-natural characteristics (Ponthieux and Meurs, 2015; Husaini and Husni, 2015). The concept of gender concerns the differences in the roles, functions, and responsibilities between women and men that can change with time. Sex considers the existence of biological differences, whereas gender considers these differences based on social constructions. Gender and development are important issues that must be considered in the field of development planning. Women, emancipation, and empowerment are ideas that form the basis of gender-based planning, and, at present, efforts are being made in the research to eliminate all gaps between men and women in the development process (Moser, 2012). To achieve this, Moser (2012) stated that the central issues of subordination and inequality must be eliminated, and development should be the focus of the research.

In a previous study, Scott (1995) indicated how gender and development are situated in the context of capitalism, socialism, and dependency and determined the social construction of gender differences. She also compared the dichotomy of modernity and tradition connected to the assumption that modernity is related to rational and productive concepts. In contrast, notions of tradition or "rural" are particularistic, fragmented, and unchanging. The dependency theory is closely related to backwardness, focusing on the masculine conception of gender-based work division (Tomalin, 2007).

Furthermore, Jaquette (2017) highlighted the constructive tension between theories and practices related to gender-based development, particularly multiculturalism issues, human rights, and political participation. Additionally, situating gender discussions from a global perspective has caused gender analysis to become crucial in terms of international development and the political economy. The discussion of the international political economy is linked to a discussion of the global capitalism trap in the contemporary era (Rai, 2018). Rai stated that there were efforts to improve women's lives in poor societies, yet, rational and maintained resource distribution (instead of fair or unfair) constantly dominates national and international policies. Therefore, the battle for gender equality development must continue.

The gender and development approach is an approach that overcomes the inequality roles between men and women and explores gender relations and their impact on development. The differences between women and men are socially constructed so that efforts are needed to create gender equality in development, including having equal opportunities and the ability to participate in development, this is related to discussions about women and development (Rubin, 1975; Barriteau, 2000; Moser, 1993; Oakley, 2016). Therefore, it is necessary to understand how women and men are socially constructed and how these constructions are strengthened by social activities that define and are defined by the community (Razavi and Miller, 1995). The gender approach in development does not specifically pay attention to women but focuses more on the way society assigns roles, responsibilities, and expectations to women and men, including how men and women work together to produce results that are neutral in terms of economy and efficiency (United Nations, 1998). Women in Development discusses the subordination of women in development, even though women are important subjects in development who should be involved in development (Razavi and Miller, 1995; Barriteau, 2000; Bradshaw, 2013; Chant and Sweetman, 2012). There is a tendency for

traditional gender roles, where women are expected to manage the household, home production, raise children, and care for family members, which are interpreted as women's responsibilities. At the same time, men are the breadwinners and responsible for market production by engaging in paid work. This causes an economic gap between men and women in the commercial sector, and this condition must be fought for with the struggle for equal rights. A Beijing Platform for Action established gender mainstreaming in 1995 as a strategy for achieving gender equality across all policy areas at all levels of governance (United Nations, 2015). In Indonesia, gender mainstreaming is established in development through Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000, which requires all government agencies at the national and regional levels to mainstream gender into the planning, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of all policies and programs. This policy legally strengthens efforts to realise gender equality in development and eliminate problems and crises related to gender and development (Yuslin, 2021). This research aims to probe the gender system in the Baduy indigenous community using qualitative research. The following section discusses the issue of gender linked to indigenous communities.

The Indigenous Community Gender Issue

Gender issues in indigenous communities remain an interesting concept related to numerous developments and changes occurring locally and globally (Acosta et al., 2019; Addison et al., 2019; Dey, 2016; Glazebrook and Opuku, 2016). The existence of indigenous communities is legally recognised at international and local levels, which means that normatively, the protection of indigenous communities has a legal foundation. However, some issues exist regarding poverty, marginalisation, injustice, and development without a basic cultural understanding. Developing the gender system will expose some contradictions (Giroud and Human, 2019; Kuhnlein, 2017; Lope-Alzina, 2020; Gebre et al., 2021). Rao et al. (2006) highlighted the education experiences of

indigenous adults related to the context of development intervention that is often politicised in terms of promoting indigenous rights. From the perspective of gender, which is the assessment of gender equality in the context of education and its key issues, gender participation is one of the requirements, including how to eliminate feelings of marginalisation from the indigenous community. It is necessary to establish gender equality-based adult education. Dey (2016) presented a field investigation of an indigenous community that experienced a traditional agricultural transformation that also occurs in the development of third-world countries, namely, a discourse of creating new agricultural practices by targeting men as the acceptors, whereas women are sidelined. This suggests that women are not the primary target for or subject of development in the agricultural sector (Lamontagne-Godwin et al., 2018; Bryceson, 2019; Njieassam, 2019; Hariharan et al., 2020; Rola-Rubzen et al., 2020; Somano, 2022; Pérez Lanza, 2020; Pankhurst & Jacob, 2019; Singh-Peterson & Carnegie, 2019; Spangler & Christie, 2020; Van der Burg, 2021; Vincent, 2022). This is known in indigenous community development studies as the gender gap.

Kuhnlein (2017) explained that indigenous people have rich cultural and traditional knowledge, yet they are attached to poverty, discrimination, and poor nutritional health. From a human rights perspective, indigenous people deserve better living conditions. Kuhnlein elaborated on the effect of gender roles in relation to food. Some traditional communities have unique traditions for fulfilling the family's food necessities. The gender role-based work division system is one way to achieve food security. Njieassam (2019) conveyed his research results in Cameroon, where indigenous women form the backbone of the food production system in their community; therefore, access to land is crucial. The fact is that gender-based discrimination related to land ownership still exists. Indigenous women face discrimination in terms of their gender, ethnicity, and economic class.

Moreover, women are often marginalised in these communities. One way to overcome the issue is by involving indigenous women in development and decision-making processes is to decrease their social and economic vulnerabilities. Collins (2019) reviewed a right-based framework from a critical feminist perspective. This perspective argues that women's rights are constructed by power relations within a particular socioculture where the power relationship is an analysis between dominant and subordinate cultures. Collins suggests that approaches to women's rights require more nuanced understandings of sociocultural differences in order to effect gender-equitable change. Institutional approaches must be based on an improved understanding of gender to achieve justice in relation to women's rights. Collins mapped the direction of the new feminist research that considers land and resources at both local and global economic levels. Glazebrook and Opoku (2020) determined obstacles faced by women farmers in Africa. The obstacles were related to climate change, gender bias, limited access to land, and financial technology. They also provided examples of women's innovative strategies to tackle the obstacles to achieving SDGs and overcome the main problems they faced: poverty, hunger, gender equality, and ecosystem management.

Objectives

The present research analyses gender in the agricultural sector from the perspective of the Baduy community's cultural background. The study thoroughly analyses the gender system using a qualitative approach, particularly in the agricultural sector. The research aims to answer gender gap issues in society, where the contention that a traditional community identifies with a culture of patriarchy that posits women as unequal to men still exists. Moreover, the expansion of the understanding of gender in the agricultural sector, particularly in the Baduy indigenous community, can elaborate on the regulation of culture implemented and constructed to create harmony in community life. This approach is conducted through a

comprehensive understanding of customs and cultural constructions on the basis of gender in the agricultural sector. This understanding is the basis of our gender-based development planning that will create positive outcomes in preventing the marginalisation of indigenous people's living systems as a result of the implementation of the agricultural development concept that is not based on gender divisions. At the global level, the study indicates the importance of accepting, recognising, and understanding the existence of indigenous people who have the right to live their lives in their individual ways, alongside practising their culture and beliefs. Moreover, it is also a lesson about local wisdom in the gender system in the agricultural sector from the culture of indigenous communities and for indigenous communities' development purposes in the future.

Methodology

Research Approach

The research employed a qualitative research method that was useful in searching for an answer to several research questions:

- The differences in the roles and functions that exist between women and men in the Baduy community.
- The differences in scope between men and women in the Baduy community.
- The access to and control of Baduy women in the productive sector.
- The differences in kinship, marriage, and inheritance patterns between men and women in the Baduy community.
- The construction of a gender system based on customary law in the Baduy community.
- How has gender system-based development been applied in the study.

A qualitative design was selected for the research since it must answer the research questions of "how", which requires a thorough and qualitative technical approach in exploring the data, information, and interpretations with intersubjectivity between the researcher and the Baduy community. A case study research strategy was employed since its focus was on the

naturalistic, holistic, and cultural perspectives, and the studied case (in this case, the Baduy people) was described (Schoch, 2020).

Data Collection Method and Data Analysis

The research employed a qualitative approach and the data collection techniques of observations, in-depth interviews, and a literature study (Denzin and Lincoln, 2000). The research was conducted thoroughly to observe the community as a system that possesses certain cultural constructions. The in-depth interview was observed to be effective if the researcher had a close relationship with the community being studied, namely, the Baduy people. The literature study was conducted using theoretical sources and other studies related to the present research.

Qualitative data were analysed in three ways: data reduction, data presentation, and conclusions (Miles and Huberman, 1994). The data reduction method included a selection process, and the focus was on the simplification, abstraction, and transformation of written data that occurred in the field. Data presentation utilised a set of compiled information that allowed us to draw conclusions. The formation of conclusions included the verification of the proposed conclusion. Several work stages, outputs, and indicators in the research were compiled from the pre-research to the data processing and analysis steps. According to Creswell (1994), the procedure for collecting and analysing the data carried out in this study went through the following stages: (1) identify the parameters for the data collection. The first step is to purposefully select informants or documents and other visual materials that can answer research questions, collect observational notes, conduct in-depth interviews and record these interviews, keep a journal during the research study, collect general documents, record social situations or individual situations or group, taking photos of the social situation, and examining the photos and collecting other documents (e.g. custom law documents, customary administration records) that support the answers to the research (2) categorising the types of data collected and providing a rationale

for data collection involving four basic types, namely observations, interviews, documents, and visual images, (3) compiling and submitting information collection protocols in which researchers engage in multiple observations during the research process. The researcher compiled an observation protocol that contained portraits of informants, dialogue reconstruction, explanations of the physical setting, special incident reports and reflective note activities, and demographic information about the time and place of the observations. In addition, the researcher conducted interviews by placing himself in an intersubjective relationship, so that both parties understood the information available both parties understood the information available, (4) data analysis was carried out simultaneously with data collection, data interpretation and narrative report writing. According to Miles and Huberman (1994) qualitative data analysis consists of data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification (5) identifying the coding procedures to be used to reduce the information into theme categories. There are flexible rules on how to select information through recorded interviews, observation notes, documents, and visual materials, form categories of information and enter codes into categories, (6) develop steps for proof, in this case highlighting the concepts of validity and reliability in qualitative research activities and organise these concepts in the procedures that appear in qualitative writing. What is done in this research is to ensure that the research highlights the problem of internal validity and accuracy of information, finds convergence among information sources, receives, and re-examines feedback from informants, and accepts limited generalisability of research findings. Referring to Yin's case study concept (2009), this case study research explores the case of gender equality in the agricultural sector that applies to the Baduy indigenous community with limited generalisations on the reported findings and uniqueness based on unique interpretive information, social situation, and reality.

Framework

Gender analysis in policy-making and programming processes considers the experiences, aspirations, needs, and problems women and men face to achieve gender equality and justice in their communities. The analysis of the roles, functions, and differences in terms of gender in the agricultural sector reflects the framework of Moser's model analysis (2012). The framework was developed by Caroline Moser and is based on the Gender and Development approach (GAD) or Women in Development (WID) approach. Several important factors obtained from the framework were implemented:

- How does gender-based work division affect women's abilities to participate in planned developments?
- How does it affect the dynamics of access and control over the use of resources between women and men in various economic and cultural contexts?
- How does paying attention to strategic gender requirements affect gender equality and empowerment?
- How does it affect the relationship between gender strategic requirements and gender practical requirements in the three roles of production, reproduction, and role in society?
- How does it affect a household that is analysed based on the gender roles and functions in the domestic/reproductive and public/productive sectors?

Results and Discussion

Baduy Indigenous People

The Baduy indigenous people inhabit an area of the Banten Province, Indonesia. They are a community that upholds traditional customs and culture. Their existence has been legally recognised with the issue of Law of the Republic of Indonesia No.6 of 2014, which recognised the traditional cultural villages, the Regional Regulation of Lebak Regency No. 13/1990 on the coaching and development of the Baduy Customary Institution, and the Regional

Regulation No. 32/2003 on the Protection of Customary Rights to Agriculture Land.

Geographically, the Baduy people reside in the administrative area of Kanekes village, Leuwidamar sub-district, Lebak Regency, Banten. Geographically, Kanekes village has a natural, hilly topography with a slope of 45% and an altitude of 300–600 m above sea level. The Baduy community comprises two groups: the Baduy Dalam and Baduy Luar. The Baduy Dalam occupies territories in Kampung Cibeo, Cikertawana, and Cikeusik. These territories have a special meaning related to obedience to tradition and function in customary rituals. The Baduy Luar lives in the Kanekes area.

Both groups bear some differences in the implementation of customs and the rights and obligations that need to be fulfilled in applying value systems and norms. An attachment to customs and traditions is stronger among Baduy Dalam than among Baduy Luar individuals (Permana, 2003). Historically, the Baduy people formed one group: the Baduy Dalam. The Baduy Luar group was formed as a result of two factors: (1) there were members of the community who violated the customary rules and were expelled from the territory and the Baduy Dalam group, and (2) there were members of the community who self-initiated to leave the community due to various reasons. The first reason was the consequence of sanctions imposed by the community on the violator of the customary rules. The second reason was called good

resignation for the change in community status. If a member of Baduy Dalam wishes to move to the Baduy Luar community, they are required to ask permission from the traditional leader, and if permission is granted, his/her status is changed. The number of Baduy Luar individuals is increasing and is larger than the Baduy Dalam community. The differences in their customs have consequences on the perception of gender that is relatively different in both communities. The provisions for regulating the gender system in the Baduy Dalam community are more detailed and stronger than those in the Baduy Luar community.

Role Arrangement and Differences in Scope of Gender in the Agricultural Sector

The definition of gender in the agricultural sector is a socio-cultural relationship between men and women that is formed or changed by the community itself, according to the construction of cultural customs surrounding it. In the current study, gender analysis focused on the aspects related to gender analysis at home and aspects of access to and control over household economic resources. The scope of household gender analysis included the roles played by both women and men in the community. In this case, the role was men’s and women’s participation in an activity or decision-making process. Table 1 demonstrates Baduy community’s gender-system-based customary construction.

Table 1: Gender is Based on Baduy's Customary Construction

Aspect	Women	Men
Scope	Domestic and rice farming	Public and cash-crops livelihood
Role and function	Reproduction, production, subsistence, nurturing, protection, household income	Subsistence-oriented production and cash, the main form of livelihood
Obligation	Expressive duties	Instrumental duties

Source : Primary Data Analysis

In domestic life, women of the Baduy community play a significant domestic role and specifically have greater responsibilities in dryland agricultural activities involving rice production.

All domestic duties, such as parenting, cooking, washing, and other household errands, become their responsibilities. Additionally, rice swidden (huma) is also their responsibility. Rice swidden

activities are subsistence economic activities where rice production is not performed to generate cash but to meet household consumption needs. The scope of the Baduy men, on the other hand, is oriented towards public spaces and farm activities that produce cash (cash crops) but can also help with domestic work.

The differences in the scope between Baduy women and men create a work division between both sexes, although it is less rigid. Work divisions between women and men in the Baduy Dalam sub-community are relatively unlike those in the Baduy Luar sub-community. These differences exist as an implication of distinction in the customary rules attached to both Baduy community groups. Work divisions in the Baduy community household are shown in Table 2.

Gender	Baduy Dalam Sub-Community	Baduy Luar Sub-Community
Women	The main tasks are domestic work, such as parenting, cooking, and washing. However, they are also involved in the productive activity of rice farming (<i>ngahuma</i>).	The main tasks are domestic work, such as parenting, cooking, and washing. They have been involved in cash-oriented activities.
Men	The main task is to earn money by making a living. They are involved in farming activities, especially in commodities that generate cash (cash crops).	Similar to Baduy Dalam.

Source : Primary Data Analysis

The variation in the work division between women and men in the Baduy Dalam and Baduy Luar communities lies in the women’s tasks and responsibilities. Women in a household in the Baduy Luar community are not only involved in their main duties in the domestic sector and farming, but they have also been involved in cash-generation-oriented activities. In other words, Baduy Luar women have a broader work scope than Baduy Dalam women in terms of their roles as additional breadwinners.

Customary rules outline that women should perform rice-related activities since rice is considered the incarnation of *Nyi Pohaci*, a person glorified by the Baduy. According to the Baduy, it is prohibited (*teu meunang*) for men to perform these duties since this is considered to be impolite to *Nyi Pohaci*. Therefore, differences are evident in the Baduy community in terms of the duties, roles, and functions of women and men. A fascinating fact, however, is that the differences do not create gender inequality. This is due to the construction of value based on customary rules that ensure women as equal to men; therefore, women are spared from

subordination to and domination by men. The following statements were collected from several Baduy members:

Managing the house and rice fields are women’s obligations; however, men do not consider the work as a low job or a job that exploits women...not at all. We respect our women, and the work is noble, and we are ready to help. We won’t let women work too hard (S, male, 47 years old, member of the Baduy Dalam community).

Our culture considers rice to be the incarnation of our lord, Sang Hyang Seri; therefore, only noble people have the right to handle it, and our culture regards women as noble creatures; hence, their duty to manage rice farming is a tribute to our custom. We, the men, are ready to help” (D, male, 35 years old, member of the Baduy Dalam community).

We feel protected and honoured by men in performing our daily tasks. There is no compulsion and exploitation, all goes well. We respect men and vice versa (B, female, 37 years old, member of Baduy Luar community).

Access to and Control of Baduy Women in Productive Sectors

The differences in the duties, roles, and functions between Baduy men and women in a household have implications for fulfilling responsibilities for both genders. In the Baduy Dalam sub-community, a man/father is the head of a family and is responsible for performing instrumental duties; his primary duty is providing household sustenance. This is to say that the father’s domain is in the family production sector. Baduy women, on the other hand, are responsible for fulfilling expressive

duties. Baduy women have an obligation to perform reproduction, servicing, nurturing, protection, and household maintenance activities. But basically, men and women help each other in these two sectors.

In the Baduy Luar sub-community, a man’s/father’s responsibilities are similar to those in the Baduy Dalam community, namely, in performing instrumental duties. These distinctions reside in the Baduy Luar women’s responsibilities, including performing instrumental and expressive duties, although they are not their primary responsibilities. The women of the Baduy Luar community trade, weave cloth, or make other crafts to be sold, in addition to their household and rice farming duties, which become a source of household income. The responsibilities of women and men in a Baduy household are presented in Table 3.

Table 3: Women's and Men’s Responsibilities in a Baduy Household

Sub-Community	Women’s Responsibilities	Men’s Responsibilities
Baduy Dalam	Expressive duties (activities of reproduction, servicing, nurturing, protection, and maintenance).	Instrumental duties (responsibility for the family’s sustenance and production).
Baduy Luar	Expressive duties (activities of reproduction, servicing, nurturing, protection, and maintenance) and some of the women also perform activities included in the instrumental duties.	Instrumental duties (the responsibilities include providing family sustenance).

Source: Primary Data Analysis

The division of responsibilities between the Baduy women and men in a household both in the Baduy Dalam and Baduy Luar sub-communities form distinct access and control between the individuals in the household productive sectors. In the agricultural sector, there is a division of labour based on the stages of work. The stages of work in farming consist of (1) *Narawas* (selecting land), (2) *Nyacar* (cutting down), (3) *Nukuh* (drying), (4) *Ngaduruk* (burning), (5) *Ngaseuk* (preparing holes), (6) *Muuhan* (planting seeds), (7) *Ngirab Sawan* (cleaning), (8) *Mipit* (harvest ceremony), (9)

Dibuat (harvesting), and (10) *Ngunjal* (transporting). The Baduy women are involved in all the stages of rice farming; therefore, these duties are some of their responsibilities. Their complete involvement, however, is in the stages of *nukuh*, *ngaduruk*, *muuhan*, *ngirab sawan*, *mipit*, and *dibuat*, whereas women are partially involved in the work stages of *narawas*, *nyacar*, and *ngunjal* in which men have complete involvement. *Narawas*, for example, is a stage that determines the piece of land to be accessed and managed (land selection). In the Baduy Dalam sub-community, the men and traditional

leaders have discussions to determine which piece of land is to be managed, whereas the women’s capacity in this activity is merely to

provide suggestions. Table 4 shows the involvement of women and men in rice agricultural (farming) activities.

Table 4: Involvement of Women and Men in Rice Agricultural (Farming) Activities

Productive Sectors	Baduy Dalam		Baduy Luar	
	Women	Men	Women	Men
Selecting land (Narawas)	++	+++	++	+++
Cutting down (Nyacar)	++	+++	++	+++
Drying (Nukuh)	+++	++	+++	++
Burning (Ngaduruk)	+++	+++	+++	+++
Preparing holes (Ngaseuk)	+	+++	+	+++
Planting seeds (Muuhan)	+++	-	+++	-
Cleaning (Ngirab Sawan)	+++	++	+++	++
Harvest ceremony (Mipit)	+++	++	+++	++
Harvesting (Dibuat)	+++	++	+++	++
Transporting/storing (Ngunjal)	++	+++	++	+++

Source : Primary Data Analysis
Description:
 +++ : High involvement
 ++ : Moderate involvement
 + : Fair involvement
 - : Not involved

Ultimately, the productive sectors in the Baduy community consist of (1) production activities for household consumption (subsistence commodities); (2) agricultural production activities for sale (cash crops and cash commodities), such as durian, duku, rambutan, and albasia; (3) household crafts/small industries (palm sugar, machete, and woven products); (4) trading daily necessities and produce; (5) gathering forest products for consumption and sale (e.g., honey); and (6) guide/tourism services (provision of accommodation, foods, and carry bags).

The agricultural production for sale (cash crops and commodities) is a valuable domain for Baduy men, both in the Baduy Dalam and Baduy Luar sub-communities. Only men have access to and control over this sector. This is related to the dominant scope of Baduy men in the public space, and commodity production and sales are related to public space since the commodities must be sold to outsiders. Baduy women and

men's involvement in productive household activities is illustrated in Table 5.

The craft production sector has become a productive source of household income, especially in the Baduy Luar community. The household craft activities that produce money in the Baduy Dalam community are only conducted by men. The crafts usually include a machete and palm sugar production. In the Baduy Luar, however, household craft activities are more varied, such as machete-making, palm sugar, knitting bags, and weaving products.

Another productive sector is trading daily necessities and produce. Baduy Luar women and men have access to and control over the sector. Several stalls exist in Baduy Luar villages that trade household goods to fulfil the villagers’ requirements. The stalls are managed by women (the mothers); however, the men buy the goods to be traded since they have to buy them outside the Baduy area, which requires transportation activities.

Productive Sectors	Baduy Dalam		Baduy Luar	
	Women	Men	Women	Men
Production activities for household consumption (subsistence commodities)	+	+	+	+
Agricultural production activities for sale (cash crops and cash commodities), such as durian, duku, rambutan, and albasia	-	+	+	+
Household crafts/small industries (palm sugar, machete, and woven products)	+	+	+	+
Household crafts/small industries (woven products) for sale	+	-	+	+
Trading daily necessities	-	+	+	+
Gathering forest products for consumption and sale (honey)	+	+	-	+
Guide service/serving tourists or outsiders (provide accommodation, food, carrying bags)	+	+	+	+

Source : Primary Data Analysis
Description:
 + : Involved
 -: Not involved

Gathering forest products, especially collecting forest honey for sale, is an activity that contributes to household income. Honey sold by the Baduy people is recognised for its originality since it is forest honey. Men have access to and control over the activity since entering the woods is considered dangerous for women due to the likelihood of encountering wild animals, such as snakes. The Baduy people generally enter the forest in groups of three to four. Cash income generated from the gathering activity is one of the paramount sources of household income. The result of the activity is valued higher when it is sold to visitors who visit the Baduy areas.

The recent developing productive sector is a guide service or service for tourists or outsiders who visit the Baduy areas. The data provided by the Kanekes village government suggests that a relatively high number of outsiders are entering the Baduy areas. Approximately 400–600 people visit Baduy annually for cultural tourism,

research, study, introducing traditional cultures, and other purposes. These outsiders require a guide, good transporters, and accommodation and consumption services. A guide is necessary since Baduy comprises a considerable area, and people do not want to get lost. Baduy villages are spread out and bordered by forests and farms.

The long route and complicated infrastructure in Baduy areas trigger the demand for good transport services since it is almost impossible for outsiders to carry their belongings. Baduy people are familiar with the difficult route and take this opportunity to offer services to carry tourists’ belongings. Some of the visitors who visit the area and want to stay usually stay at the villager’s houses. During their stay, the visitors require food, and the Baduy women cook for them. The Baduy women receive cash from the visitors for their services. Access to and control of Baduy women and men in productive household activities are shown in Table 6.

Productive Sectors	Baduy Dalam		Baduy Luar	
	Women	Men	Women	Men
Activities for household consumption (subsistence commodities)	+++	+++	+++	+++
Agricultural activities for sale (cash crops and cash commodities), such as durian, duku, rambutan, and albasia	-	+++	++	+++
Household crafts/small industries (palm sugar, machete, wand oven products)	++	+++	++	+++
Household crafts/small industries (woven products) for sale	+++	-	+++	-
Trade daily necessities	-	++	++	+++
Gathering forest products for consumption and sale (honey)	++	+++	-	+++
Guide service/serving tourists or outsiders (provide accommodation, food, and carry bags)	+	++	++	+++

Source : Primary Data Analysis
 +++ : High access and control
 ++ : Moderate access and control
 + : Fair access and control
 - : No access

The discussion presented above indicates that the access and control of Baduy women and men in the productive sector are different, both in the Baduy Dalam and Baduy Luar sub-communities. This distinction is not a reason for one party to be subordinated by another since the division of duties, roles, functions, and responsibilities are equal and based on customary rules that prohibit the subordination and domination of one party over another.

Gender in relation to Kinship, Marriage Patterns, and Inheritance Patterns in the Baduy Community

Baduy people are considered to have one line of descent; therefore, they know most of their relatives (generally of kinship). Hence, their marriages are primarily in one kinship (endogamy), which establishes extended kinships due to marriage and blood relations. Kinship in the Baduy is bilateral (bilateral kinship or descent), suggesting that establishing marriage-based kinship does not mean that the

man’s family is more important than the woman. A marriage bond automatically creates kinship ties between both families. Therefore, the principle of the kinship formation process is created from a marriage bond or blood relationship which describes the equal position of the man and woman’s families. The man’s family and the woman’s family are equally important and have the same position in making decisions regarding the affairs of both families.

Baduy people practice endogamy, which is marriage in the same general kinship as the Baduy tribe. Common marriage, however, is the marriage of one kin. Baduy people consider a cross-cousin marriage, both from the father’s and mother’s sides, as the best type of marriage. Baduy Luar people, on the other hand, have the freedom to determine their own mates; however, they must come from the same Baduy tribal line, not from the line of kinship that comes from blood relations.

There is a basic difference in marriage between Baduy Dalam and Baduy Luar people. A marriage in Baduy Dalam is called *kawin batin* (inner marriage) since it is a lifetime marriage. A married couple (*urang tangtu*) can only be separated by death. Customary rules prohibit a divorce. It is also an absolute requirement for a marriage to be performed in a traditional or government office in the community. Someone is not fit for office if he/she is not married. If the wife of a traditional or government leader dies during his tenure, he must first relinquish his position until he finds a new life partner. Conversely, the Baduy Luar sub-community permits divorce, but it is something that must be avoided.

The Baduy community does not permit polygamy. A wedding ceremony in the community places women in a high position in the marriage-ritual and decision-making processes concerning where the couple will live and start their new lives. In the proposal ceremony, the groom is required to consecrate to the family of his bride for a day (in the first marriage proposal) and three days in a row (in the second marriage proposal). Through this devotion, the bride's family can evaluate the sincerity and responsibility of the groom regarding marriage. This is deemed essential since a man, in his future domestic life, must have responsibilities that last for a lifetime. In their marriage and domestic lives, a husband and wife have equal power (bilateral marriage), clear work divisions, and mutual respect regarding their roles and functions. Violence against wives and children is not permitted. A household has no subordination and domination as long as the family obeys the *pikukuh* and customary rules that have been determined.

Regarding inheritance issues, there is no distinction in the amount of inheritance received by the son and daughter; both of them receive the same portion. Unmarried sons do not receive an inheritance. His married sibling first manages his inheritance, and his inheritance is returned to him when he is married. Land inheritance is not practised in the Baduy Dalam sub-community since land is shared property and cannot be

privately owned. A newly married couple can discuss with traditional community elders to determine the area of arable land to manage. In the Baduy Luar community, land can be inherited since it is privately owned. When parents die, land ownership is given to their children with equal distribution to their sons and daughters. Suppose the family's children are not adults yet or are unmarried. In that case, the responsibility to manage the inheritance falls to the brothers/sisters of their father/mother according to a mutual agreement. When the children are married, the inheritance is returned to them. Therefore, there is no difference between men and women regarding inheritance. They have the same inheritance rights. The arrangement of inheritance is also confirmed in the customary regulations; thus, the Baduy people must obey them.

Understanding the Construction of the Traditional Value System as a Basis of Gender Equality Development

The construction of values and norms is rooted in the Baduy life philosophy and is based on the harmonisation of positions, roles, and functions of men and women arranged by customary rules and tradition. In Baduy customs, a woman's caretaker, protector, and guardian position is well-integrated from the household to a broader level in the community. The roles and functions of a mother that are tied to her nature to bear children mean that her honour and dignity are positioned in a high and noble place. Moreover, the basic philosophy states that women incarnate into rice, which is the source of nobility and fulfilment in the present lifetime (Permana, 2003).

The harmonisation of men's and women's positions, roles, and functions is reflected in the balanced concept that the Baduy people uphold. Balance and harmonisation are applied in every aspect of life, both in the context of the household and community in general. They are also applied to the relationship between humans and their relationship with nature. In a household, relationships and interactions between the household members reflect balance and harmonisation. Domestic violence is

considered arrogance that surpasses the power of the Almighty. Arrogance is a taboo behaviour. Domestic violence is rare in Baduy households (Anwar and Muslih, 2021).

Baduy people uphold equality in honour and dignity in a broader community group. Equality is mirrored in their everyday lives. There are no differences between the leader and ordinary citizens in the community. It is not permitted to demean one another. Additionally, the division of roles and functions between men and women is placed in the context of equality without demeaning one another.

Harmonisation and balance inside and outside a Baduy household support the fact that community members have no discord and enmity; hence, the behaviour and attitude toward each other are maintained according to the customary rules. Community members have no rights and power to violate or change the existing order that is perpetuated from generation to generation. Community adherence to customs and cultural traditions called *pikukuh* is the key to safety and peace in community life (Sujana, 2020). *Pikukuh* are the guidance and direction of individual behaviour in the Baduy community, including prohibited and allowed behaviour. The Baduy community maintains their customs and traditions despite having a different way of life from the outside Baduy community. They believe that only adhering to customs, maintaining cultural traditions and obeying *pikukuh* will save their lives. By carrying out *pikukuh*, they believe Batara Tunggal will protect them as a trusted God. If they do not follow and obey *pikukuh*, Batara Tunggal will punish them with life's sufferings.

Discussion: Gender System, the Culture of Baduy Indigenous People, and their Development

The implementation of gender-responsive development for the Baduy indigenous people is a challenge in the research at present. However, in this discussion, we observed that Baduy indigenous people believe that they practice gender equality. The Baduy custom deems rice production as part of a cultural ritual that must

be preserved for generations. Paddy/rice is considered the incarnation of Nyi Pohaci/Sang Hyang Seri, whom the Baduy people glorify (Permana, 2003). Hence, the meaning is not merely subsistence but a continuously preserved customary practice (Anwar and Muslih, 2021; Sujana, 2020). Only women have the honour to manage rice, from planting to cooking practices. Domestic tasks and rice farming are not paid for with cash but in the form of women being dignified in the household and at the customary level. The division of work does not create an unequal power dynamic in a household since income gained in the household is managed together. The money must be managed together. Women have the power to make decisions for the household and community since they traditionally have a noble position.

The debate of gender equality development is implemented in the form of freedom and empowerment of women so that women have economic power or access to cash (Collins, 2019; Ponthieux and Meurs, 2015; Scott, 1995). Gender and development are also placed in a framework of gender equality from a modern perspective, assuming that all traditional perceptions must be replaced. The current research highlights gender equality from the perspective of indigenous people with a strong cultural bond, which they apply by maintaining their traditional views. Should gender equality be based on a modern perspective with a sense of economic power or access to cash for women? Or, is it the traditional perspective of gender equality that gives rights and glorifies women to have power in decision-making activities and receive a place in the gender debate? It is necessary to enforce conformity and adaptation between the implementation of customs and gender mainstreaming; thus, Baduy women have more economic independence. The gender-based development approach should be followed by an understanding of custom-based gender by development planners since the existence of indigenous people is protected by international law. Finally, the study attempts to understand the gender equality perspective according to the Baduy indigenous people and presents empirical facts that can be understood

and learned. This is essential for compiling a gender-responsive development approach for indigenous people in the research by considering their social–cultural characteristics since gender equality is significant not only from morality and justice perspectives but also from an ideological perspective and is culturally relevant.

Conclusion

The study describes the other side of gender and development by explaining the uniqueness of specific cultural constructions, especially in gender systems in the agricultural sector, so it can be assumed that indigenous communities' traditional customs and cultures do not encourage gender inequality. Moreover, a custom arrangement based on the construction of the existing culture is able to create harmony in the community through the arrangement of work division, gender-based roles, and kinship, marriage, and inheritance systems that drive the creation of gender equality. Increased efforts should be made regarding the development strategies that are specifically intended for the indigenous communities with an orientation towards their gender-related peculiarities and superiority. This highlights the importance for us to understand indigenous communities' lifestyles, develop plans based on this understanding, and protect their rights to continue their ways of life, preserving their traditions and cultural constructions from generation to generation.

References

Acosta, M., van Bommel, S., van Wessel, M., Ampaire, E. L., Jassogne, L., & Feindt, P. H. (2019, May). Discursive translations of gender mainstreaming norms: The case of agricultural and climate change policies in Uganda. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 74, pp. 9-19. Pergamon.

Addison, M., Ohene-Yankyera, K., & Mujawamariya, G. (2019). *Gender, selected agricultural innovations and intra-household income in Ghana*. *AgEcon Search*, <http://ageconsearch.umn.edu/ageconsearch@umn.edu>.

Anwar, J., & Muslih, M. (2021). Efektifitas Pikukuh Baduy Tentang Perkawinan Kebal Cerai Bagi Masyarakat Adat Baduy. *Madinah: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 8(1), 21-30.

<https://doi.org/10.58518/madinah.v8i1.1331>

Barriteau, E. (2000). *Re-examining Issues of "male Marginalisation" and "masculinity" in the Caribbean: The Need for a New Policy Approach*. Centre for Gender and Development Studies, University of the West Indies.

https://scholar.google.com/scholar?hl=id&as_sdt=0%2C5&q=Barriteau%2C+E.+%282000%29.+Reexamining+Issues+of%22+male+Marginalisati on%27and%27masculinity%27in+the+Caribbea n%3A+The+Need+for+a+New+Policy+Approach.+Centre+for+Gender+and+Development+Studie s%2C+University+of+the+West+Indies&btnG=

Bradshaw, S. (2013). Women's role in economic development: Overcoming the constraints. *UNSDSN*.

<https://repository.mdx.ac.uk/item/8569z>

Bryceson, D. F. (2019). Gender and generational patterns of African deagrarianization: Evolving labour and land allocation in smallholder peasant household farming, 1980–2015. *World Development*, 113, 60-72.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2018.08.021>

Chant, S and Sweetman, C. (2012). Fixing women or fixing the world? 'Smart economics', efficiency approaches, and gender equality in development. *Gender & Development*, 20 (3), 517–529. doi:10.1080/13552074.2012.731812. S2CID 154921144.

Collins, A. M. (2019). Financialization, resistance, and the question of women's land rights. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 21(3), 454-476.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2018.1532805>

Creswell, J.W. (1994). *Research Design Qualitative & Quantitative Approaches*. Sage Publication. Thousand Oaks. London. New Delhi

Denzin, N.K. & Y.S. Lincoln (eds). (2000). *Handbook of Qualitative Research. (Second Edition)*, Thousand Oaks: Sage Pul. Inc

- Dey, S.(2016). *New Agriculture, New Knowledge and New Gender Roles: Sharing the Experience of an Indigenous Community*. Social Science Review ; The Dhaka University Studies, Part -D, Vol.33, No.2, December 2016
- Dore, A. (2021). Menakar Peluang Dan Tantangan Pengakuan Hutan Adat Dalam Peraturan Menteri Lingkungan Hidup Dan Kehutanan No. 17/2020 Tentang Hutan Adat Dan Hutan Hak. *Jurnal Ilmiah Maju*, 4(1), 27-33.
- Dudgeon, P., & Bray, A. (2019). Indigenous relationality: Women, kinship and the law. *Genealogy*, 3(2), 23. <https://doi.org/10.3390/genealogy3020023>
- Glazebrook, T., & Opoku, E. (2020). Gender and sustainability: Learning from women's farming in Africa. *Sustainability*, 12(24), 10483. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su122410483>.
- Giroud, A., & Huaman, J. S. (2019). Investment in agriculture and gender equality in developing countries. *Transnational Corporations*, 26(3), 89-113.
- Gebre, G. G., Isoda, H., Rahut, D. B., Amekawa, Y., & Nomura, H. (2021). Gender differences in agricultural productivity: Evidence from maize farm households in southern Ethiopia. *GeoJournal*, 86(2), 843-864.
- Husaini, A., & Husni, R. (2015). Problematika Tafsir Feminis: Studi Kritis Konsep Kesetaraan Gender. *Al-Tahrir: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, 15(2), 367-388. DOI : 10.21154/al-tahrir.v15i2.264.
- Hariharan, V. K., Mittal, S., Rai, M., Agarwal, T., Kalvaniya, K. C., Stirling, C. M., & Jat, M. L. (2020). Does climate-smart village approach influence gender equality in farming households? A case of two contrasting ecologies in India. *Climatic Change*, 158(1), 77-90.
- Jaquette, J. S. (2017). Women/gender and development: the growing gap between theory and practice. *Studies in Comparative International Development*, 52(2), 242-260.
- Kuhnlein, H. V. (2017). Gender roles, food system biodiversity, and food security in Indigenous Peoples' communities. *Maternal & child nutrition*, 13, e12529. <https://doi.org/10.1111/mcn.12529>
- Lope-Alzina, D. G. (2020). Indigenous Women In Agriculture. *Routledge Handbook of Gender and Agriculture*, 13. Routledge, Oxon OX14 4RN
- Lips, Hilary M. (2020). *Sex and gender: An introduction*. Waveland Press
- Lamontagne-Godwin, J., Williams, F. E., Aslam, N., Cardey, S., Dorward, P., & Almas, M. (2018). Gender differences in use and preferences of agricultural information sources in Pakistan. *The Journal of Agricultural Education and Extension*, 24(5), 419-434. [http s://doi.org/10.1080/1389224X.2018.1491870](http://s://doi.org/10.1080/1389224X.2018.1491870).
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook*. Sage.
- Moser, C. (2012). *Gender planning and development: Theory, practice and training*. Routledge.
- Njieassam, E. E. (2019). Gender inequality and land rights: the situation of indigenous women in Cameroon. *Potchefstroom Electronic Law Journal/Potchefstroomse Elektroniese Regsblad*, Vol 22(1).
- Noorikhsan, F. F., & Gunawan, H. (2022). Mengkaji Ulang Konsep Kemiskinan Melalui Pendekatan Ekonomi Politik. *Journal of Government and Politics (JGOP)*, 4(2), 133-154. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.31764/jgop.v4i2.10324>
- Oakley, A. (2016). *Sex, Gender and Society*. Routledge.
- Permana, C.E. (2003). *Kesetaraan Gender dalam Adat Inti Jagad Baduy*. Wedatama Widya Sastra. Jakarta
- Ponthieux, S., & Meurs, D. (2015). Gender inequality. In *Handbook of income distribution* (Vol. 2, pp. 981-1146). Elsevier. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-444-59428-0.00013-8>
- Puspitawati, H. (2013). *Konsep, teori dan analisis gender*. Bogor: Departemen Ilmu Keluarga dan Konsumen Fakultas Ekologi Manusia Institut Pertanian Bogor.

- Pérez Lanza, C. B. (2020). Young Women In Management Positions Additionally, Gender Relations. *The Agricultural Sector Of Cienfuegos Province. Case Studies. La ventana. Revista de estudios de género*, 6(51), 163-187. <https://doi.org/10.32870/lv.v6i51.7057>
- Pankhurst, D., & Jacobs, S. (2019). Land tenure, gender relations, and agricultural production: the case of Zimbabwe's peasantry. In *Agriculture, Women, and Land* (pp. 202-227). Routledge.
- Rai, S. M. (2018). *Gender and development. In Handbook on the International Political Economy of Gender*. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Razavi, S and Miller, C. (1995). From WID to GAD: Conceptual shifts in the Women and Development discourse. *United Nations Research Institute Occasional Paper series* United Nations Research Institute for Social Development. <https://www.econstor.eu/handle/10419/148819>
- Rola-Rubzen, M. F., Paris, T., Hawkins, J., & Sapkota, B. (2020). Improving gender participation in agricultural technology adoption in Asia: from rhetoric to practical action. *Applied Economic Perspectives and Policy*, 42(1), 113-125. <https://doi.org/10.1002/aep.13011>
- Rubin, G. (1975). *Sex Gender System*. Cambridge University Press
- Schoch, K. (2020). Case study research. *Research design and methods: An applied guide for the scholar-practitioner*, 245-258. Sage Publications
- Scott, C. V. (1995). *Gender and development: Rethinking modernization and dependency theory*. Boulder, CO: L. Rienner Publishers.
- Singh-Peterson, L., & Carnegie, M. (2019). Integrating gender in agricultural development initiatives across the South Pacific: Customs, values and intersections. In *Integrating Gender in Agricultural Development*. Emerald Publishing Limited. <https://doi.org/10.1108/978-1-78973-055-520191002>
- Somano, T. T. (2022). Assessing the Impacts of Gender Inequality in Agricultural Production: In the Case of Mokonissa Woyge Kebele, Damot Gale Woreda, Wolaita Zone. *Social Sciences*, 11(1), 22-32.
- Spangler, K., & Christie, M. E. (2020). Renegotiating gender roles and cultivation practices in the Nepali mid-hills: unpacking the feminization of agriculture. *Agriculture and Human Values*, 37(2), 415-432. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10460-019-09997-0>
- Sujana, A. M. (2020). Pikukuh: kajian historis kearifan lokal pitutur dalam literasi keagamaan masyarakat adat Baduy. *Historia: Jurnal Pendidik Dan Peneliti Sejarah*, 3(2), 81-92.
- Tomalin, E. (2007). *Gender studies approaches to the relationships between religion and development*. Working Paper. University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK. Identification Number/DOI: ISBN: 0704425459/9780704425453. http://www.religionsanddevelopment.org/files/resourcesmodule/@random454f80f60b3f4/1202734475_WP8.pdf
- United Nations. (1998). Shifting views of women and development. Africa Recovery. *United Nations*. 11. April 1998. <https://www.un.org/ecosoc/en/ev/geninfo/afrec/bpaper/boxseng.htm>
- United Nations. (2015). Re-Thinking Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality in 2015 and Beyond. United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
- Vincent, K. (2022). Gender In Agricultural Additionally, Pastoral Livelihoods In Sparc Countries In Sub-Saharan Africa Additionally. *The Middle East: A Review*. SPARC (Supporting Pastoralism and Agriculture in Recurrent and Protracted Crises). <https://www.sparcknowledge.org/sites/default/files/documents/resources/Gender%20in%20agricultural%20and%20pastoral%20livelihoods%20in%20SPARC%20countries%20in%20sub-Saharan%20Africa%20and%20the%20Middle%20East.pdf>

Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods* (Vol. 5). Sage. [https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=id&lr=&id=FzawIAdilHkC&oi=fnd&pg=PR1&dq=Yin,+R.+K.+\(2009\).+Case+study+research:+Design+and+methods+\(Vol.+5\).+Sage.&ots=l_6V2cjUZo&sig=8exCUMtg-n3hj1IVSAGVT_azD3s&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q&f=false](https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=id&lr=&id=FzawIAdilHkC&oi=fnd&pg=PR1&dq=Yin,+R.+K.+(2009).+Case+study+research:+Design+and+methods+(Vol.+5).+Sage.&ots=l_6V2cjUZo&sig=8exCUMtg-n3hj1IVSAGVT_azD3s&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q&f=false)

Yuslin, H. (2021). Pembuktian Strategi Pengarusutamaan Gender (PuG): Analisis Capaian Indeks Pemberdayaan Gender di Indonesia. *Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Statistik Indonesia*, 1(3), 162-170. DOI: 10.11594/jesi

Conflict of Interest

The author declares that she has no conflict of interests.

Funding

The author received no financial support for this article's research, authorship, and/or publication.

Acknowledgements

The author would like to thank the Institution for Research and Community Service (LPPM) Universitas Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa for supporting this research. The author also acknowledges the anonymous reviewers for their valuable contributions.